THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SURFACE TRANSPORT (SHRI JAGDISH TYTLER): (a) The ongoing negotiations between Hyundai Ship-yard and Hindustan Shipyard Ltd. and Cochin Shipyard Ltd. are regarding the future shipbuilding orders from Indian ship owners. The negotiations have not broken down.

(b) There is no such proposal.

12.00 Noon

(The Deputy Chairman in the Chair)

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

Notification of the Ministry of Surface Transport

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SURFACE TRANSPORT (SHRI JAGDISH TYTLER): Madam, I lay on the Table, under sub-section (3) of section 458 of the Merchant Shipping Act, 1958, a copy (in, English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Surfacs Transport (Shipping Wing) Notification G.S.R. No. 385(E), dated the 27 th April, 1993, publishing the Merchant Shipping (Examination of Engine Drivers of Sea-Goint Ships) Amendment Rules, 1992. [Placed in Library. *See* No. LT-4148/93]

Memoranding of understanding between Government of India and the Bongaigaon Refinery and Petrochemicals Limited for the year 1993-94

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF PETROLEUM AND NATURAL GAS (CAPT. SATISH SHARMA): Madam, I lay on the Table a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas) and the Bongaigaon Refinery and Petrochemicals Limited for the year 1993-94. [Placed in Library. *See* No. LT-4195/93]

Notifications of the Ministry of External Affairs

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI R. L. BHATIA): Madam, I lay on the Table, under sub-section (3) of section 24 of the Passports Act, 1967, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of External Affairs:—

(i) G.S.R. No. 484(E) dated the 1st July, 1993, appointing the first day of July, 1993 as the date on which the Passport Amendment Act, 1993 (35 of 1993) shall come into effect.

(ii) G.S.R. No. 485(E), dated the 1st July, 1993, publishing the Passport (Amtndment) Rules, 1993. [Placed in Library. *See* No. LT-4157/93]

Notification of the Ministry of Home Affaire

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME, AFFAIRS (SHRI p. M. SAYEED): Madam, I lay on the Table, under section 31 of the Deihi Administration Act, 1966, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Home Affairs Notification S.O. 374(E), dated the 11th June, 1993 extending the susprnsion of the operation of certain provisions of the said Act for a further period of six months with effect from the 13th June, 1993, in respect of Union Territory of Delhi. [Placed in Library. *See* No. LT-4197/93]

RE, : DEMAND TO SUMMON SHRI H. R. BHARDWAJ, MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS, FOR CLARIFYING HIS POSITION REGARDING T.V. INTERVIEW

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : माननीय उपसभापति जी, कौंसिल आफ मिनिस्टर्स के एक सदस्य ने जो राज्य सभा के सदस्य हैं उन्होंने यह कहा है कि

Many Cabinet Ministers are involved in the Securities

मैं केवल यह कहना चाहता हूं कि इसका स्पष्टीकरण होना चाहिए । एक कौंसिल आफ मिनिस्टर्स के सदस्य ने, जो इस सदन के सदस्य हैं, उन्होंने बताया है. . . (**व्यवधान**)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैडम, मेरी मांग है कि आप निर्देश दें, भारद्वाज जी को कि वे यहां आकर एक्सप्लेन करें कि स्थिति क्या है । भारद्वाज जी इस सदन के सदस्य हैं । हम लोगों को अधिकार है क्योंकि समाचार-पत्रों में छपा है कि उन्होंने एलीगेशन लगाया है कि उनके मंत्रिमंडल के लोगों ने पैसा लिया है। उन्होंने. . . (**व्यवधान**) . . .

उपसभापति : एक मिनट ।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : यह बड़ा गंभीर मामला है । मेरी मांग है कि चेयर की तरफ से डाइरेक्शन होनी चाहिए । This is a privilege issue. He should be called. *(Interruptions)* He owes responsibility. *(Interruptions)*

उपसभापति : प्लीज़ बैठिए । . . . (**व्यवधान**)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मैं तो भारद्वाज जी की तारीफ करता हूं कि कम से कम मंत्रिमंडल में एक आदमी तो ईमानदार और सच्चा निकला, जो कि सच्चाई की बात कह रहा है कि लोगों ने पैसा लिया है ।

उपसभापति : बैठिये । जस्ट ए मिनट नारायणसामी जी । आपने मांग करी. . . (**व्यवधान**) . . . आर्डर प्लीज । आपने मांग करी है और सरकार ने सुन लिया। जो भी होगा उसके आगे वह करेंगे।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : आप आदेश दीजिए . . . । (**व्यवधान**) . . .

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त) : सदर साहिबा, मेरा कहना यह है कि एक तो जब भी अहम सवालात यहां आते हैं तो यहां कैबिनेट मिनिस्टर्स साहबान में से कोई तशरीफ नहीं रखते हैं ।

†شری سکندر بخت : صدر صاحبہ میرا کہنا یہ ہے کہ ایک تو جب بھی اہم سوالات یہاں آتے ہیں تو یہاں کیبنیٹ منسٹر صاحبان میں سے کوئی تشریف نہیں رکھتے ہیں

उपसभापति : मिस्टर एन्टोनी यहां पर बैठे हैं ।

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: "The Union Minister, Shri Arjun Singh and former Ministers Shri P. Shiv Shan-ker and Shri M. L. Fotedar have madet money." *(Interruptions)*

मैडम, एक दूसरे सदन के सदस्य पर आरोप लगाया गया है, इसलिए एक्सप्लेनेशन आवश्यक है । इतना ही नहीं इस सदन के सदस्य शिवशंकर जी और फोतेदार जी पर आरोप लगाया गया है । . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . .

उपसभापति : प्लीज़ बैठ जाइये । . . . (**व्यवधान**) मिस्टर माथुर, पहले तो आप अपनी जगह से बोलते या यहां से बोलने की इजाजत ले लेते । आप मेरी कुर्सी पर बैठे हैं लेकिन वहां भी मेरी बात नहीं सुन रहे हैं ।

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER (Gujarat): Madam, since the issue has been raised, I would not like to say anything on the merits but I am prepared to face any enquiry that might be undertaken by the hon. Members.

(Interruptions)

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh): The allegation is made . *(Interruptions)* ...

† [ ] Transliteration in Arabia Script

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, you scmmon Mr. Bhardwaj. ... *(Interruptions)* ... Let Mr. Bhar. dwaj be summoned. Madam, we are demanding summoning of Mr. Bhardwaj. *(Interruptions)*

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : गवर्नमेंट भारद्वाज साहब को बुलाने की बात करे और वह अपनी पोजीशन क्लेरीफाई करें। (व्यवधान)

شری سکندر بخت: گورنمنٹ بھاردواج صاحب کو بلانے کی بات کرے اور وہ اپنی پوزیشن کلیری فائی کریں۔ "مداخلت"۔

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (Uttar Pradesh): Mr. Bhardwaj should come to the House.. .*(Interruptions).* Madam, you called Mr. Shiv Shanker. You also call Mr. Bhardwaj.. . *(Interruptions)* .. .

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Madam, this is a matter of privilege.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: We are. demanding summoning of Mr. Bhardwaj.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): This House cannot be run like that. . *(Interruptions)* . .. Now the statement has appeared. You summon Mr. Bhardwaj.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: This is a matter of privilege. . . . *(interruptions)* . ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, will you now take your seat?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, it is a matter of privilege. Mr. Bhardwaj is a Member of this House . *(Interruptions)*.. .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I havei not said anything... *(Interruptions)* ... Just a minute. I am standing you have to hit down .. . *(interruptions)* ... If you don't want to sit, then I will sit down, you all stand. No *problem... (Interruptions)...* The thing is... (Interruptions,) ... Just a minute.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: You permit us to speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have spoken.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: No, we have not. You kindly identify people for . . . *(interruptions)*. ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am taking to Mr. Jaipal Reddy. Let me finish. Listen.. .*(Interruptions)*.. . How do we manage this House? If there is any discussion before the House, we take it up. In a mention on a newspaper report you are saying it. I cannot allow a discussion on it.

(Interruptions)

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Let him continue, Madam.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहेबा, न्यूज़पेपर रिपोर्ट का सवाल नहीं है। भारद्वाज साहब का अपना बयान है। (व्यवधान)

شری سکندر بخت: صدر صاحبہ نیوز پیپر رپورٹ کا سوال نہیں ہے بھاردواج صاحب کا اپنا بیان ہے۔۔: مداخلت:۔

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Where is the Law Minister?

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : अगर भारद्वाज साहब नहीं आते तो प्रधान मंत्री स्वयं आ कर बतायें कि उनका मिनिस्टर क्या कहता है।

SHRI S, JAIPAL REDDY: Will you kindly allow me?.*(Interruptions)*.. , Just a minute ...

† [ ] Transliteration *Jn* Arabic Script

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: Let the Prime Minister come.. . *(Interruptions)*.. .

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: What is this? You summon Mr. Bhar-dwaj...; *(Interruptions)*.*. Since this is a very serious matter, you summon Mr. Bhardwaj.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, yesterday we obliged you.
(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If thirty people are speaking at the same time, how do you expect me to be heard? If you sit down, then, I can take a decision. I cannot even speak... *(Interruptions)*..

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Maharashtra); Madam, identify us one by one.
(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute.. . *(Interruption)*.. .

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA; Madam, *I* want **two** minutes.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: On what matter do you want to speak? .. . *(Interruptions)* .. .

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: Only half a minute. I wan(only half a minute.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA; Madam, I want two minutes.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, if you are so concerned about a matter, and if twenty people are speaking at the same time, I can assure you I cannot match your voice.
(Interruptions)

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : यह एक ही इसयू है कि भारद्वाज साहब को बुलाया जाए और वे आकर के स्पष्टीकरण करें कि कौन कौन मिनिस्टर हैं जो सिक्युरिटी स्कैम में इनवालवहैं ।

श्री सिकदर बख्त : सदर साहेबा, ताज्जुब की बात यह है कि कोई अहम सावल अगर उठता है, उस अहम सावल के सिलसिले में गवर्नमेंट की तरफ से उस पर कोई रियेक्शन सुनाई नहीं देता । यह बतायें, कि आखिर इतने शदीद इल्जाम काउंसिल आफ मिनिस्टर्ज के मैम्बर्स पर लगाए गए हैं । उनकी कोई सफाई होनी चाहिए ।

†شری سکندر بخت: صدر صاحبہ۔ تعجب کی بات یہ ہے کہ کوئی اہم سوال اگر اٹھتا ہے۔ اس اہم سوال کے سلسلے میں گورنمنٹ کی طرف سے اس پر کوئی ری ایکشن سنائی نہیں دیتا۔ یہ بتائیں۔ بلائیں کہ آخر اتنے شدید الزام کاؤنسل آف منسٹرز کے ممبرس پر لگائے گئے ہیں ان کی کوئی صفائی ہونی چاہیئے۔

गवर्नमेंट क्या कहना चाहती है, बोले इस सिलसिले में । बोलते क्यों नहीं ये लोग । कमाल की बात है ।

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA; Madam, this is an important matter. *(Interruptions)*.. .

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY; Why don't you identify? *(Interruptions)*.. .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; No. How can I identify? *(Interruptions)*.. . How can I identify when ten people are standing? *(Interruptions)*. First they should have respect for you and tit down... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : अब मैं अकेला खड़ा हू । बैठिए ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Let everybody sit down. They don't res-you. It is a question of the Chair. I identify you. But ten people are standing together. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam,.. .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, please take your

† [ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script

seat. *(Interruptions')*... Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, this is not the way. I will tell you we are all.. .*(Interruptions)*... This is not the way at all. *(Interruptions)* ... Why are you speaking still? This is not the way to speak to the Chair. *(Interruptions)*... I am suggesting.... *(Interruptions)*... You hear me. You don t listen to me. *(Interruptions))*... You keep on talking when you say you are listening to me. I don't have the same voice that you have been granted by God. My suggestion is that if you feel that an allegation is being made or the Minister... *(Interruptions)*... Just a minute. Please listen to me first. If he! has to be called to the House you make a written request to the Chairman. *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): Madam, you have not followed what the Members want to say. *(Interruptions)*... First listen to them and then you ... *(Interruptions)* .

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: You won't listen to us. *(Interruptions)* ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You speak what you want to speak. *(Interruptions)*.. . Not everybody. Let me *listen* to one person.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: (Karnataka): Madam, ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, while thanking you for the opportunity you are good enough to give me, let me state that the hon. Law Minister, Mr. Bhardwaj, stated that many Minis ters had been bribed by Mr. Harshad Mehta. I must state that the very outset that I must compliment Mr. Bhardwaj for his forthrightness and frankness. I will not object if Bharat Ratna is con ferred on him for his act of truthfulness. So, Madam, since the Minister was stric ken by pangs of conscience and came out with the truth, he must come out with more truth. Therefore, I suggest, Madam, that the Minister be summoned here

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: He is a Member of this House.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY; None of us has levelled any allegations. On the contrary, we are offering handsome compliments to him. Therefore let Mr. Bhardwaj be summoned.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Utar Pradesh): You pass a vote of confidence in his favour.

SHRl S. JAIPAL REDDY: Secondly, yesterday I tried to raise the qcestion of polygraph test. Mr. Harshad Mehta is undoubtedly a broker.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now this is the second matter. That is another matter. It has nothing to do with (he Bhardwaj matter.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY; How can it be a different matter? I am talking of the same subjeot. Mr. Har., shad Mehta subjected himself to the polygraph test. You may spare the Prime Minister for the present. Why can't Mr. Khandekar, Mr. Mohan Khandelwal, Mr. Sunil Mittal and Mr. Manmohan Sharma be subjected to polygraph test? *(Interruptions).*

AH HON. MEMBER: Why not the Prime Minister? *(Interruptions).*SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: No, you can spare the Prime Minister for the present. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let Mr. Hanuma'flthappa speak. *(Interruptions)*... Mr. Jaipal, you had your Say. *(Interruptions)*... Now, Mr. Hanu-manthappa.

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : महोदया,. .

उपसभापति : उनको बोलने दीजिए । हनुमनतप्पा बोल दें ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; I have allowed Mr. Hanumanthappa, *(In terruptions)* ... Please, one minute.

Let me allow the Member on the right and on the left and on the front also.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Madam, .. .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, we are not having a discussion. It is a demand from the Opposition.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; What is your point of order ?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, Mr. Jaipal Reddy just now quoted the need for a lie detector test. Now you may have noticed that a foreigner, who hass been brought to this country by a Member of Parliament of this House, said that he wolud love to administer a lie detector test to the Prime Minister. This is an insult to the whole cocntry and a Member of Parliament should be associated with a, foreigner.. *(Interruptions)..* It is there in *The Statement.* It is there in the *Statement-* A foreigner is saying "I would like to administer a lie detector test to the Prime Minister of India." Whatever may be our differences with the Prime Minister, he is still the Prime Minister of India. *(Interruptions).* The Prime Minister may be under a cloud but We don't need foreigners to administer lie detector tests to the Prime Minister of our country. May be, they have lost their sense of patriotism That is a different matter. But on this matter they should condemn it and ask for the deportation of this foreigner who is ... *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Madam. I respect Shri Sikander Bakhtji and the hon. Members sitting in the front line who are senior and veteran parliamentarians. Mr. H. R. Bhardwaj is a Member of this House. He is a member d the Council Ministers. Madam, if some one wants to say something, there is a provision. They should have given notice for that. Why should he be summoned? *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is a method for that. That is what I told. *(Interruptions').*

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Will you expend some courtsey to listen Mr. Pramod Mahajan? If you want to speak only for publicity purpose, that is a different thing. *(JnterfuptMiu), _.*

श्री विष्णु कान्त शास्त्री (उत्तर प्रदेश) : यह आरोप लगाया गया है . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री एच० हनुमनतप्पा : भाई आरोप लगाया है, वह कोई भाग तो नहीं गया है । सम्मन करने के लिए जो आरोप लगाए हैं, वही हैं । वह हमारा मैम्बर है, मैम्बर आफ कौंसिल आफ मिनिस्टर्ज है, तो उसको सम्मन करो, बुलाओ, पकड कर लाओ– इसकी क्या जरूरत है । वह भाग नहीं गया है ।

श्री विष्णु कान्त शास्त्री : हम तो उनका सम्मान करना चाहते हैं । . . . (व्यवधान)

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: There is a news item. The Minister is here. Mr Bhardwaj is a Member of this House. He might have heard it. He has every right to react.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM (Kerala); Sum. moning a Member is correct usage.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: No. *{Interruptions)* I am sorry. *(Interrup, tions).* Summon is used in the sense that a notice should be issued.

AN HON. MEMBER: What notice?

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Notice to appear. 'Summon' is used in a court as a notice *(Interruptions).* According to

Rule 238, if you want to raise some issue, you have to give notice to the Chairman before raising that issue. *(Interrupttons).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; jH$_e$ cannot be produced from thin air without giving him time. *(Interruptions).*

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहिबा, हम कोई गर्मी प्रोड्यूस नहीं करना चाहते और कोई सम्मन की, और पकड़ कर लाने की बात नहीं थी । हम ऐसा महसूस करते हैं कि इस हाउस के एक आनरेबल मैम्बर ने एक बात कही है । उनके खिलाफ कोई एलीगेशन नहीं है । उन्होंने एलीगेशन किए हैं और अपने ही कोलीग्ज़ जो कौंसिल आफ मिनिस्टर्ज में उनके साथ हैं उनके खिलाफ सीरियस एलीगेशन किया है ।

तो हम चाहते हैं कि हमारे यह आनरेबल मैम्बर इस हाउस में तशरीफ लायें और पूरी तफसीलात इस हाउस के सामने रखें, ताकि असल लोगों के असल चेहरे हिन्दुस्तान के सामने आयें । पर हो यह रहा है कि शोर है, एक करप्शन का शोर है । रोज एक नया चेहरा हिन्दुस्तान के सामने आता है, रोजना करप्शन के गुल में एक नए गुल का इजाफा होता है और इस मुल्क में लोगों को आज भी इस किस्म के शोर को दबाने की जुर्रत होती है ।

हमारी दर्खास्त है कि हमारे आनरेबल मैम्बर, भारद्वाज साहब इस हाउस में तशरीफ लायें और जो एलीगेशन उन्होंने खुद अपने कोलीग्ज के खिलाफ लगाई है उसको बाकी सबूत क्या हैं, बाकी चेहरे क्या हैं, उन चेहरों को खोल कर सामने लाया जाए ।

شری سکندر بخت : صدر صاحبہ ہم کوئی گرمی پروڈیوس نہیں کرنا چاہتے اور کوئی سمن کی اور پکڑ کر لانے کی بات نہیں تھی ۔ ہم ایسے محسوس کرتے ہیں کہ اس ہاؤس کے ایک آنریبل ممبر نے ایک بات کہی ہے ان کے خلاف کوئی الیگیشن نہیں ہے انہوں نے الیگیشن کئے ہیں اور اپنے ہی کولیگز جو کاؤنسل آف منسٹرس میں ان کے ساتھ ہیں ان کے خلاف سیریس الیگیشن کیا ہے ۔ تو ہم چاہتے ہیں کہ ہمارے یہ آنریبل ممبر اس ہاؤس میں تشریف لائیں اور پوری تفصیلات اس ہاؤس کے سامنے رکھیں ۔ تاکہ اصل لوگوں کے اصل چہرے ہندوستان کے سامنے آئیں ۔ یہ ہو یہ رہا ہے کہ شور ہے ۔ ایک کرپشن کا شور ہے ۔ روز ایک نیا چہرہ ہندوستان کے سامنے آتا ہے روزانہ کرپشن کے غل میں ایک نئے غل کا اضافہ ہوتا ہے اور اس ملک میں لوگوں کو آج بھی اس قسم کے شور کو دبانے کی ضرورت ہوتی ہے ۔ ہماری درخواست ہے کہ ہمارے آنریبل ممبر بھاردواج صاحب اس ہاؤس میں تشریف لائیں اور جو الیگیشن انہوں نے خود اپنے کولیگز کے خلاف لگائی ہیں اس کے باقی ثبوت کیا ہیں ۔ باقی چہرے کیا ہیں ۔ ان چہروں کو کھول کر سامنے لایا جائے ۔

† [ ] Transliteration is Arabic Script

उपसभापति : ठीक है, बस बात खत्म है । अभी सब लोगों को इस पर क्या बोलना है । आपने एक बात कही गुरुदास दासगुप्त जी . . . **(व्यवधान)**

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : एक-एक बुलवाइए ।

उपसभापति : नहीं-नहीं, एक क्यों बुलवाइए । एक क्यों बुलवाइए । आपके लीडर ने बोल दिया, जयपाल रेड्डी जी ने बोला, दो-तीन दूसरे लोगों ने यहां पर यह बात उठाई, कांग्रेस की तरफ से भी बोल दिए, अभी कोई यह मत . . . **(व्यवधान)**

Can you keep quiet for a minute?^ *(Interruptions)..*

एक मिनट माथुर साहब, एक मिनट . . . **(व्यवधान)**

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मुझे कहने दीजिए । . . . **(व्यवधान)**

उपसभापति : प्लीज, एक मिनट । आप कह चुके हैं . . . **(व्यवधान)**

Half of the time is wasted in saying 'please sit down'. If you listen to me we can save time and perhaps I can give time to you. *(Interrttptiora),..*

Now the thing is.. . *(Interruptions).-* The matter that is being raised the question is, the Minister should come and give a persona explanation, whatever it is... *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: He said it outside the House.. . *(Interruptions).-* . THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Whatever he has said inside the House or outside the House..,, *(Interrupt fora).**,* There is a procedure. Now I cannot pro_ duce the Minister from thin air. You have said it and we have heard it and that is all. Now let us go ahead with other business.. . *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Is there a procedure?...; *(Interruptions').*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA; Madam, I am sorry. But this matter does not end here. You cannot put this matter to rest here.. .*(Interruptions).. .*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What do you expect me to *de.. (Interrup tions).*^

SHRI YESHWANT SINHA: We expect you to direct the Member and the hon. Minister to come to this House. The Parliament is in session. Mr. Bhardwaj is a Minister. He is a Member of the Council of Ministers and he makes a statement outside the House concerning the Government. Now he will not come to this House... *(Interruptions)*^

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: He must be summoned hero..... *(Interruptiotui).* This country... *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA; Madam there is a matter of privilege .... *(Interruptions).. .*

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: There is an immoral Govemment sunning th* country and the Government must go.. . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, there is a matter of *pcivilege (Interruptions).. .*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If there is a matter of privilege you move it... *(Interruptions).. .*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: There is a matter of privilege because Mr. Bhardwaj has cast aspersions on the character of some Members of this House because the Council of Ministers includes also the Members of Rajya Sabha. His allegation tantamounts... *(Interruptions).. .*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; You move a motion of privilege. You don't need the Chair's permission to move it. *(Interruptions).. .*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: It tantamounts to bribe-taking by Members of Rajya Sabha. Therefore, it is a matter of grave concern to us. We feel absolutely dishonoured to even share the House with Members who have been taking money from a broker. Therefore, the cloud of suspicion must be cleared. We want to know who these hon. persons are. .. *(Interruptions).. .*

उपसभापति : चिल्लाइए, आपका हाउस है । आप बडी खुशी से चिल्लाइए मुझे कोई एतराज नहीं है । मेरी ही नहीं,

[उपसभापति]

जिम्मेदारी आपकी भी है। . . . (व्यवधान) चिल्लाइए, जरूर चिल्लाइए। . . . (व्यवधान) मुझे क्यों थ्रेटन कर रहे हैं। . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मैडम, सब से बड़ी बात यह है कि उन्होंने कहा कि . . . (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : चिल्लाइए, बड़ी खुशी से चिल्लाइए। . . . (व्यवधान)

SHR GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: What are *their* names?. . . *{Interruptions)* . . . We want to know who are the persons who have taken money. This is disr-honourable. . *(Interruptions). ..*

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : अगर उन्होंने . . . (व्यवधान) . . . नम्बर एक. . . (व्यवधान) एक प्रकार से. . . (व्यवधान) . . . उनके खिलाफ प्रिविलेज ही बनना चाहिए। मैं मूव कर रहा हूं कि उन्होंने इस सदन के दो सदस्यों के ऊपर आरोप लगाया है, फोतेदार साहब पर और शिव शंकर जी पर।

It is a question of privilege also. .. *(Interruptions)* . . . केवल वह नहीं, सारी कैबेनेट, प्रधान मंत्री जिम्मेदार हैंइसके लिए। अगर वह नहीं आ सकते तो प्रधान मंत्री को आकर यहां पर जवाब देना चाहिए।

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: It is an ex tremely serious matter.. . *(Interruptions).. .*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: We cannot share the House where there are some people who have taken money... *(Interruptions)....*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, please go back to your seat... *(Interruptions) . ..*

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : डिप्टी चेयरमैन साहिबा, अगर कोई रेसपांस प्रइम मिनिस्टर साहब से नहीं आता है तो हम मजबूर हैं कि हम इस हाउस से अंडर प्रोटेस्ट वाक आउट करें। . . . (व्यवधान)

हम वाक आउट कर रहे हैं।

شری سکندر بخت: صدر صاحبہ میری گزارش سن لیں... مداخلت... گورودا س جی پلیز... مداخلت... صدر صاحبہ میں عرض کرنا چاہتا ہوں میری گزارش سن لیں ... مداخلت... میری گزارش سنیئے پلیز... مداخلت... اوپیندر جی پلیز... مداخلت... صدر صاحبہ سن لیجئے پلیز...

(At this stage some hon. Members left the Chamber)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Let Mr. *Bhardwaj give* an explanation. There is no point in conducting the proceedings of the House when the Minister makes allegations. . . . *(Interruptions) . . .*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Mr. Bhardwaj must be called to this House.. *(Interruptions)*.. .And he must explain his conduct.. . *(Interruptions) . . .*

SHRI S, JAIPAL REDDY: Rule 238 is not applicable. We are not levelling allegations against Mr. Bhardwaj.. . *(Interruptions)* Mr. Bhardwaj has levelled avi allegation... *(Interruptions) .*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Bhardwaj should come and clarify. . *.(Intermpitons).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Minister for Parliamentary Affairs wants to say something...*(Interruptions).* Please sit down.. . . *(Interruptions) .*

आप जरा शांति से बैठिए, मंत्रीजी कुछ बोलना चाह रहे हैं। एक मिनिट, वह कुछ बोलना चाह रहे हैं, सुनिए।

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: He is not Mr. Bhardwaj.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Never mind. He is the Parliamentary Affairs Minister. You cannot dismiss the fact... *(Interruptions) ...*

श्री एस० एस० अहलुवालिया (बिहार) : मैडम, प्रॉब्लम कुछ नहीं है, प्रॉब्लम सिर्फ इतनी है कि राज्य सभा के कुछ सदस्य लोक सभा की गैलरी में बैठकर वहां भाषण सुनना चाहते हैं और इसलिए ये राज्य सभा चलने नहीं देना चाहते

† [ ] Transliteration in Arabic Srript.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: No... *(Interruptions).* You are being ur" ir... *(Interruptions)* . . _

SHRl V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): The Janata Dal MPs go by what the *Indian Express* says... *(Interruptions).*

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH (Bihar): THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing you... *(Interruptions).* I am not allowing anybody. . .*(Interruptions').* It is not going on record...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SIN^.':*

THR DEPUTY CHAIRMAN वह रिकार्ड में नहीं जा रहा है । सिर्फ मंत्रीजी बोलेंगे, उनको बोलने दीजिए . . . (व्यवधान) . . . कोई एक लफ्ज नहीं जाएगा । आप बैठ जाइए । मैं अलाउ नहीं कर रही हूं ।

Idid not ask him to stand up... *(Interruptions)* This is 'not the way to behave in this House.. . *(Interruptions)* I am not allowing. . . *(Interruptions)*

विधि मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री और संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (डा० अबरार अहमद) : मैडम, एच० आर० भारद्वाज जी, विधि मंत्री हैं . . . (व्यवधान) . . . मैडम, एच० आर० भारद्वाज जी न सिर्फ मंत्री है बल्कि इस सदन के सदस्य भी हैं। माननीय सदस्यों की जो भावना है वह मैं माननीय भारद्वाज जी तक पहुंचा दूंगा ।

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: We are disappointed. We cannot accept this reply. . .*(Interruptions)* The Minister should have said that he was going out to bring him back. .. *(Interruptions)* Madam, you have the right to call him. Please exercise that *right. ..(Interrup, tions)* You have the authority. I am surprised that you are not exercising your authority.. . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Any issue concerning Ministers can be raised only with the permission of the Chairman. I do not know under what rule you are raising it.... *(Interruptions)*

*Not recorded.

SHRl YASHWANT SINHA: You are asking under what rule. Under what rule did Mr. Bhardwaj, the Law Minister, make that statement? *{Interruptions)* You are asking about the rule. . . *(Inter. raptions)* Under what rule has your Party take the bribe? *(Interruptions)* Under what rule has the Cabinet Minister taken the bribe? *(Interruptions).*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Mr. Yashwant Sinha is a very senior Member of this House... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Under what rule has the Prime Minister taken Rs. 1 crore? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VTSHVJIT P. SINGH (Maharashtra): Are we going to decide things by what the *Indian Express* says?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Today, you have talked about *Indian Express* enough. *Indian Express* has the capacity to withstand all your blackmails. You know that.. .*(Interruptions)*

मौलाना ओबेदुल्ला खान आजमी (उत्तर प्रदेश): मैडम श्री भारद्वाज जी को बुलवाइए । मिनिस्टर साहब ने यह कहा है कि हम अपोजीशन की भावनाएं भारद्वाज जी तक पहुंचा देंगे, तो क्या वे यह भावना पहुंचाएंगे कि भारद्वाज जी ने हुकूमत को चोर कहा है । यह भावना पहुंचाएंगे अपोजीशन की ? इसलिए मेरा मुतालबा है कि आप भारद्वाज जी को बुलवाइए और साथ पूरा जवाब दिलवाइए । यह बहुत ही सेंसिटिव मामला है ।

مولانا عبید اللہ خاں اعظمی: میڈم شری بھاردواج جی کو بلوائیے۔ منسٹر صاحب نے یہ کہا ہے کہ ہم اپوزیشن کی بھاونائیں بھاردواج جی تک پہنچادیں گے، تو کیا وہ یہ بھاونا پہنچائیں گے کہ بھاردواج جی نے حکومت کو چور کہا ہے یہ بھاونا پہنچائیں گے اپوزیشن کی اس لئے میرا مطالبہ ہے کہ آپ بھاردواج جی کو بلوائیے اور ساتھ پورا جواب دلوائیے۔ یہ بہت ہی سینسیٹو معاملہ ہے۔

† [ ] Transliteration in Arabic Srript.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, why are you not using your authority? Your authority should be used on such, occassions. We request you to act.

मौलाना अबैदुल्ला खान आजमी : क्या हम मान लें कि सरकार के मंत्री भारद्वाज जी ठीक बोले हैं। . . . (व्यवधान) उनको बुलवाइए। क्या उनको भी वोटिंग के लिए रोका गया है? . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Unless Mr. Bhardwaj come and clarifions, no business will be allowed. . . *(Interruptions)* ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Sinha, the Parliamentary Affairs Minister has to get him. Mr. Bhardwaj is not here.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: You tell the Parliamentary Affairs Minister to go and call him.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He cannot move now.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It is your authority to call and it is our right to demand has presence.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Let the Parliamenary Affairs Minister be directed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If the House can throw, if the Members can throw the rule book. I can not do it. You give me in writing. You give me in writing what you want that Mr. Bhardwaj should come to this House. I will contact him.. .*{Interruptions)*.. . Mr. Paswan, you are a new Member. Don't behave like this. Otherwise, I will throw you out of the House. आप जरा तमीज से यहां बैठिए। आप नए मैम्बर हैं, ऐसी हरकतें मत कीजिए।

The thing is, you give me in writing as to what you want to have. Then, I will do what is needful. Nobody is say ing no... *{Interruptions)* .. .I told the Parlianwsntary Affairs Minister that whatawer is available.,..*(Intenuptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, you will recollect, the whole House will recollect that there were occasions in the past where a Minister was summoned immediately. We had also been in the Government and there were occasions where even the Prime Minister came to this House. Prime Minister had come to this House on the demand of the Members.. .*{Interruptions)* .,.,. SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: You please raise the issue in a proper form. Did you get permission from the Chair?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please listen. No one is disputing that. I only want that some procedure is followed because you have made a request that Mr. Bhardwaj should come. What is the harm if you give it in writing?... *(Interruptions)* . . .You can give it in "vriting. . . *(Interruptions)'*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, the Government is expected to respond to the demand of the Members in th© House and there are numerous occasions in the past where not only the Ministers but the Prime Ministers have been called to the House to reply to a perticular point. In this particular case, there is no reason why Mr. Bhardwaj should not at all. . .*(Interruptions)...It* is well within come to this House. There is no reason your authority, after having listened to the Members, to direct the Parliamentery Affairs Minister to produce Mr. Bhardwaj. Ask him to secure his presence here. It is his responsibility. He cannot only lie a communicator of *Bhavna.* He must. . . *(Interruptions)* ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Neither me nor the Parliamentary Affairs Minister has said that we are not going to call. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam* you have full authority. You have all the authority to direct the Parliamentary Affairs Minister to get Mr. Bhardwaj, to secure his presence in this House.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: For that, did you follow the proper procedure? Did you get permission from the Chair?...*{Interruptions)*...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह : उनको यहां बुलवाइए . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

उपसभापति : यहां मेरा कोई घर नहीं है कि मैं इन्वीटेशन देकर बुलाऊं . . (व्यवधान) . .

I run this House in accordance with certain rules of procedure. You let me do it. I am going to comply with your request but you come forward with a certain procedure. I will agree to it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It is a very strange It is a very strange situation because under what rule do we write to you and say, you summon Mr. Bhardwaj under this rule"? This is the difficulty. This is the demand of the House. He made a sit Cement and we are saying that he must come to this House and clarify the position. Rule 238 does not apply, Ru'le 238 is absolutely wrong. It is not applicable to this case.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: It is always jour discretion.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, let me respond to rule 238.. .*(Interruptions)*.. .

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: You get the permission from the Chair first.. . *(Interruptions)*.. .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is quoting a rule.

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : जब तक भारद्वाज जी नहीं आते, तब तक हाऊस एजडोर्न करवा दीजिए। (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : नहीं, मैं क ई हाऊस डजोर्न नहीं कर रही ।

I am not going to adjourn the House. I am sitting here.. . *(Interruptions)*.. .

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, here is the rule. Madam. Mr. Hanuman thappa and Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan, both of them have said that we should table a motion under rule 238. Madam. may I, in all humility, submit that this rule does not apply in this case? applies only if we are levelling any allegation against Mr. Bhardwaj. On the contrary, as I, said earlier, we are com-plir nting Mr, Bhardwaj for his extra-orainary truthfulness... *(Interruptions)*... Therefore, the rule does not apply here. It is Mr. Bhardwaj who has levelled allegations and we are not levelling allegations. Therefore, the rule does not obiously apply. Both Mr. Hanumanthappa and Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan have re-ceflfiy become senior Members and they should read the rules more carefully . . . *(Interruptions)*. ..

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan): Msdam, I am on a point of order.. . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Mr. Jaipal Reddy, even for complimenting, proper word should be used. The word "summon" should not be used. . . *(Int -rruptions)*.. .This is not the way... *(In. terrupfions)*. . . This is all that *f* want to say. .. *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Mr. Hanumanthappa, as a Member of the JPC, has got used to summoning people...*(In. teruptions)*. . .

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: I am nos; a Member... *(Interruptions)*.. . Let me complete.. . *(Interruptions)*.. . Even Mr. Yashwant Sinha, when we shouted from the Opposition side, used to stand up and react saying that he would pass on to the Government and the Govern-rnsnt would react. That is the situation. But you are not allowing the House to function.. . *(Interruptions)*.. . This is not the way.. . *(Interruptions)*.. .

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The word summon" was used by me in the literal sense. not in the legal sense.. . *(Interrup-(ions)*.. .

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, Ifeel that there is a little confusion which T want to clarify. Mr. Hanumanthappa has not been very fair when he asks us not to use th$_e$ word "summon". The House is an institution. We can also say.

"वे कृपा करके तशरीफ लाएं यहां पर"

He says, "Please don't use that word.".. . *(Interruptions)*.. . Don't get agitated over that. The issue is very simple. The issue is that we have not, Members from this side, levelled a single allegation against

[Shri Kamal Morarka] Mr. Bhardwaj. If we want to make any allegation, rule 238 is there and we are fully aware of that and we will follow that. But here a very peculiar situation has arisen. In the country, after the last Session adjourned in May, there has been a spate of allegations against the Government by people who I could never dream of being capable of levelling allegations. It is a broker and "broker" is the lowest term in society. A share broker holds a Press conference and levels allegations! It is a sad day for the country. Hera what has happened is that, suddenly, a Member of the Council of Ministers not only corroborates that allegation, but also says that many of his colleagues have taken money from this gentleman! This is very strange and it is very sad.. . *(Interruptions)...* Madam, I would have expected, .when the House met this morning, that Mr. Bhardwaj would come and make a *suo motu* statement either denying that interview or substantiating whatever he had said or he could have said whatever he wanted to say. Members are agitated over the newspaper reports. And, what is the reaction we have got? The Parliamentary Affairs Minister says some benign thing. I have no complaint against him because he cannot do more than that- He was not even a Minister when the alleged money transaction took place. When the Members are agitated, you say, "Please follow this rule and that rule". I want to ask my friends on the other side; Are you not ashamed when a Minister says that half of his colleagues have taken money from the share broker? What is the point he is coming to? I think, it is all the more necessary that let us all persuade Mr. Bhardwaj to come to this House ard deny this outright. Let him say that nobody has taken from this fellow who is himself under indictment. Or if Mr. Bhardwaj feels, he should come out with whatever facts he has. All that we are doing in the Opesition is that we are focusing the attention of the House or the country to a matter which is a mater of public shame not only to this Government- but also to the entire political system. And what response are we getting? You are trying to shut ocr voice. Please add your voice to our voice and come to the bottom of this scandal. That is all my request to the Members on the other side. And what procedure you want to follow, I do not mind.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now... *(Interruptions)* Let me react to it.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Madam...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Sukomal Sen, you cannot add anything more to what Mr. Kamal Morarka has said. Will you please take your seat? Let me reply to it.

SHRl SUKOMAL SEN; Madam, only one point.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: lust a minute.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Madam, it is perhaps the biggest scandal that the Government is facing.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have heard it. There is nothing new you are adding to it. *(Interruptions).* You are not adding any more points to whatever he has said. The same is repeated.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: That is why, Madam, you should direct the hon. Minister to come and clarify what he wants to say.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Have you added anything new? There is nothing new. What Mr. Morarka and others said, you are repeating the same. Please do not waste the time of the House. *(Interruptions) J*ust a minute Mr. Morarka and the rest of the people from the Opposition side have made their point. You have heard something or you have read something in the newspaper, and it is attributed to Mr. Bhardwaj who is not only in the Council of Ministers but is a Member of the also. Now you want Mr. Bhardwaj to be called to this House or to be requested to come over here to explain. That is what you want, that he should explain?

SHRl KAMAL MORARKA: Yes.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA; He should make a statement...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Whether he explains in writing as a statement or he makes a personal explanation or whatever he likes...

SHRl GURUDAS DAS GUPTA;: Or he disowns his statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. I don't need anybody to put words in my mouth, Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta. I have been a Member of this Hause longer than you. So, I know what I should speak from the Chair. I am not passing any aspersion on you. But I am just saying that the procedure of the House is that when the Chair speaks, just, listen to me because when you star-allegations that I am blockading it, nobody is blockading anything. Nobody is blockading anything. That is why I allowed.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA Nobody has said it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; The question is that Mr. Bhardwaj is not present here at the movement. The Parliamentary Affairs Minister performed his duty Chat he will contact Mr. Bhardwaj and tell him this, and the rest of the people... *(Interruptions)* Just a minute.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: He is in the other House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Maybe he is in the other House. If you are in his place, what else do you.. . *(Inter, ruptions)* Please. I have seen this House.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, if the Government does not collapse today, will he come tomorrow? That is what I want to know.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; The thing, is, I have been in the Chair when you have been in the Government and some others have been in the Government. I know the same answer the Parliamentary Affairs Minister had given. So, he has given this answer. Please give him time. *(Interruptions)* Give him time.. . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, the issue can be resolved if you could direct the Parliamentary Affairs Minister to fix a time for the presence of Mr. Bhardwaj in this House. Let it be today, tomorrow or any time. You fix it. *(Intenuptions)*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I suggest...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You make me get up to be heard. I am really having an exercise, up and down. The thing is this. That is why I was requesting our hon. Member that you have raised it on the floor of the House orally and why don't you strengthen the hands of the Chair by giving it in writ ing what you want? What is the object-tion? This is the procedure. I do not want... *(Interrup-tions)* I do not want to lay new pro cedures and precedents in this House where on a mention made orally in the House I summon people. No. I would not do it. You please give in writing that this thing happened. What is the harm?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It is not a question of summoning. It is a question of asking the Minister to be present. If is a question of asking the Minister to come to this House. It is not a question of summoning people. I can quote specific examples, if you want. We can verify from the records. I have got up here in this House as leader of the House to say that "so and so will be present at 3 o'clock and will make a statement on this." I remember an issue .raised by Mr. N.K.P. Salve and we immediately summoned the then External Affairs Minister to make a statement, and the Prime Minister, Mr. Chandra Shekhar, was summoned to this House. This House is all—powerful. Why are you dithering? Why are you scared of calling Mr. Bhardwaj? *(Interruptions)-*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I never summon anybody.

SHRl YASHWANT SINHA; That is what I am repeatedly saying. You have the authority. I now request the Parliamentary Affairs Minister, through you, that he should have the sense to put an end to this debate by getting up and saying that Mr. Bhardwaj will come to this House at such and such time. That will be the end of the matter. *(Interruptions)-*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He must find out whether Mr. Bhardwaj is available.

SHRl YASHWANT SINHA; He has to find out. He is saying it to the print media - Let him say it here... *(Interruptions)* .

SHRl MD. SALIM (West Bengal): If be cannot come, you adjourn the House. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Mr. Bhardwaj's matter is not a matter to be listed. We have today come to this House- • • *(Interruptions)* May be, but please listen.

SHRl MENTAY PADMANABHAM: You take the sense of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Today the House is 'being caned not to discuss Mr. Bhardwaj's matter. I have listed business here... *(Interruptions)* There is no reason for me to adjourn the House. Why should I?

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDH URY (Andhra Pradesh): The nation is looking at us collectively. . . *(Interruptions)* whether the Opp osition is colluding with the Congress, because they think that we are all guilty bscause what a member of the Council of Ministers has said is a reflection on us collectively.. . *(Interruptions)* "Nothing is more important today for us than to restore the dignity and honour of Parliament and we have to summon him to come and speak. You don't want us to known as a bunch of thieves.. .*(Interruptions)* I strongly object to it- Let the House be adjourned till he comes.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; No, I will not adjourn th© House because I have got other business.

SHRI E. BALANANDAN (Kerala): We have to call him.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: May I request you to call him, to summon him? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: You fix a time or adjourn the House. Let the Parliamentary Affairs Minister report to you, you fix the time.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Let us adjourn the House till Mr. Bhardwaj comes.. . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: We pro pose that Mr. Bhardwaj be respectably invited to this House.. . *(Interruptions)* ; i,

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: While this request is going to Mr. Bhardwaj, shall we not do some other business?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no,,.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You think Mr. Bhardwaj's statementt Ras imporant!

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It is important. It is an extra ordinary situation that Mr. Bhardwaj's statement has to be made.

SHRI E. BALANANDAN: You take) it seriously. Till then, you adjourn the House.. . *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not convinced that I should adjourn the House.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: This House can take up Mr. Bhardwaj's business. .. *(Interruptions)* Madam, can you recall, (throughout the history of Indian Parliament and Indian democracy, a single other instance where a Minister has made such a statement? Are we living in normal times? This is a most extraordinary situation.

SHRI M. A. BABY (Kerala): The Minister is available in the lobby.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not know what is happening in the lobby.. . *(Intenuptions)*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: We are compelled to conclude that Mr. Bhardwaj has deliberately kept away from the House.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: He has been hijacked by his colleagues.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: What other inference can be drawn from his studied absence? We canot transact any ofher business. *(Interruptions)*

SHRl M. A. BABY: Please adjourn the House and find out whether he is in 'he lobby or not.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I can not be there at two places at 'he same time. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam it is unfortunate that we are not able in make the Minister come to th© House. We fell totally dishonoured. We feel totally humiliated. We feel that the dignity of the House is totally at the botton because, never before in the history of Parliament, the Council of Minis'er-, had been brought to such disrepute by a member of the Council of Ministers it . It should be an end in itself. All of us now function under the shadow of a suspicion. The entire treasury bench is dishonoured. They are equally ashamed as we are. The whole House is ashamed. Therefore, the suspicion must he cleared and. in order to clear the suspicion, the Minister must come.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: T am now going ahead with the business. (In-terruptions) Should we take up Special Mentions of the Statutory Resolution? *(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Madam, I am sorry. It is he sense of the House that the Minister should be[1] called.This is the courtesy extended to the sense of the House.

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, I want to correct my statement.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH; Madam, may I say something? Mr. Baby, please let me speak. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have identified Shri VISHVJTI P. Singh.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: Madam, a let of things have been said. A lot of things about hypocrisy, a lot of things the dignity of the House. .

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Honour of the Members. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: Kindly allow me to hake my point. I would request you, in all humility and with folded hands, to kindly permit me to *complete* my sentence.

Now, l"t me put this in perspective. The first thing is — I think everybody will agree with me in this — that there is no allegation against Mr. Bhardwaj.

SHRl MOHD. KHALEELUR RAHMAN (Andhra Pradesh): You came very hue perhaps. He said it. *(Interruption.*

SHRI VISHV.TIT P. SINGH: I know he said it. but I am reiterating it here. Therefore, on the basis of an allegation. he cannot he called here. In fact, there is no allegation against Mr. Bhardwaj.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Agrea... *(Interruptions*)

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: Please hear what I have to say.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: You do not even hear what he is saying. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: I have to say miny things, f have said only

[Snri Vishvjit P. Singh] elimination. The second point is, the so-called statement allegedly made by Mr. Bhardwaj refers to a matter which is already under enquiry by the J.P.C *(In. lerruptions)* . You may laugh. You may laugn till kingdom come, but kindly.. .

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Till kingdom comes down.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: You may say what you like, Jaipal. I am not willing to get involved in any verbal duel. I am only making my submissions. You can either accept what I am saying or reject what I am saying. My first proposition you have rejected. My second proposition is that the so-called alleged statement made by Mr. Bhardwaj refers to a matter which is already under the consideration of the JPC.

SHRI E. BALANANDAN: No, it is the statement mad by the Minister that other Cabinet Minisers have taken money. That is the point.

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL alias MEEM AFZAL (Uttar Pradesh): He has said about one of Ministers, who is a Member of the Rajya Sabha also.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, the question is that the JPC is to be seized of the matter. They have to summon Shri Bhardwaj and ask him whether he has really said all this. We cannot discuss this once the JPC is seized of tne matter. But in this case summons has Mot been issued to Shri Bhardwaj. As long as the summons is not issued to him, we can raise this matter in the House. He has not bees called by the JPC so far. He has to be called by the JPC.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: The fact of the matter is that because there is nothing to put in writing, nobody is willing to put in writing. *(Interruptions).* Why don't you give in writing?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Bhardwaj made no statement before the JPC. Therefore it is not correct *to* assume that this matter is under the consideration of the JPC. Mrl Bhardwaj had the good sense to make a statement to a well-known journalist, Mr. Pritisfal Nandy who has been of late organising his famous popular "Nandy show". Mr. Pritish Nandy cannot be considered a critic of the Government. Therefor, Mr. Bhardwaj's statement cannot be considered to be under the consideration' of the JPC. This is a wrong plea taken by Mr. Vishvjit Singhji. I know, Mr. Vishvjit Singh is an indefatigsable defender of the indefensible.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is the riddle I cannot understand.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA; I have got my allegation. The allegation is, when the JPC was looking into the irregularities and if the Minister was in possession of such a sensitive information that pay-offs had been made tO a number of members of the Council of Ministers which ttntamounts to participation in corruption, in collusion with the broker, the Minister on his own, Shri Bhardwaj on nis own, should nave snared the information with the Parliament oh with the JPC. This is my allegation against him. My tllegation is that Mr. Bnardwaj, being a Minister of Law,

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will not allow *it.* It will not go on record. Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, it is not going on record. *(Interruptions).* I will permit, yon. *(Interruptions).* The thing is, howsoever agitated yon might be, you should also realise is which manner you speak. Mr Gurudas Das Gupta, let us not go beyond certain bounds and say things which are not to be mentioned in this House.

Secondly, I would gay that whatever allegation might be there, nobody is disputing that Mr. Bhardwaj should not come here. We are only thinking how he should be called. Until and unless

*Not recorded.

I speak fo him or somebody *speaks to* him, arbitrarily . . *(Interruptions).* Just a minute, please. Now, every minute spent in this House costs a lot of mo ney. We also have to think of the amount of money we have lost today in not transacting some business. It might amount fo wasting the money of the country—I won't use the word 'corrup tion', but washing the money.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Corruption also involves money.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes. (*Interruptions)* . Instead of wasting the time of .+his House we could have transacted some business, taken up the Consumer Protection Bill or some such BilI which has larger ramifications also for the people of this country. *(Interruptions).*

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Don't teach .. .(Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sit down. Don't interrupt me, please. While we are waiting for Mr. Bhardwaj to come over here, we could transact some good busi ness, and give a good example to the nation that though we are agitated. we are still transacting good business. We have done enough today. We have only half an hour. Let's go ahead. There is some business listed here. What yon wanted to say, you have said.

AN HON. MEMBER: What time ... *(Interruptions). . .*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How can I fix till I speak to the person? I don't speak irresponsibility in this House. What ever I say in this House, I abide by It. I am not like anybody making a statement and not sticking to it. If I say that I am going to call so-and-so person at 10 o'clock. I will see to it that the person comes at 10 o'clock. So I say, let me have some time and let us do some business now.

SHRT YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, we have listened to you with a great deal of patience.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN- I am so thankful to you.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: You have, told us that we are wasiting money. We have accepted it. Democracy is a costly business. Having elections also costs money. So it can't be somebody's argument that we should foot hold elections because they are expensive. That can't be an argument. But the point is—I have repeatedly said this— all that we need from you, Madam, is, just fix the time. How can we be more reasonable? I can't imagine how we, in the Opposition, can be more reasonable than that.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: ASK them to produce the Minister.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: *f* must be able to talk to the person concerned.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Mr. Bhardwaj is a Member of this House. Just tell him to come. Tell him that by 2.30 he should be here in the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Who?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Mr. Bhardwaj .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Who will tell him?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: You will tell him. Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let ma find out from him... *(Interruptions).-*.

~SHRI M. A. BABY: He was there in the lobby. Having heard our discussion, he has withdrawn himself from there also. This is ridiculous. ... *(Interruptions')* . .. SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: When reasonable requests are not met, then we are compelled to be unreasonable at times.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: I am not really able to understand this. The Parliamentary Affairs Minister is here. He can as well go and contact Mr. Bhardwaj.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Baby, you have got the privilege to go into the lobby, leaving your seat. I don't enjoy that privilege while I am sitting in the Chair ... *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: What about the Parliamentary Affairs Minister? What about other colleagues?

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: Madam> I have to make a request to the Chair.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me hear Mr. Balatoandan.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: My name is not Balanandan.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sorry. Somebody called you "Balanandan" and that went into my head. Mr. Balaram, I am very sorry.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: I am not worried about it. You are completely upset, I know.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Naturally. I have to deal with 200 Members.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM; The entire House is in a difficult situation, according to me, because we don't share your views, though not your rulings, personally because all of us feel that when he has made a statement outside, he could have made a statement here also. I think it is a violation of the entire thing. So we feel, let that gentleman come and make a statement here. This is our position. Now I would like to . ask you one or two questions. Do you think this House is so helpless that We cannot ask him to come and make a statement?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nobody said it. You didn't hear me. There is no point in reguing before me because I have told the Minister, it is for the : Govemment. It is the responsibility of the Government. You might talk to them, not to me.

SHRI N. E BALARAM: Madam. I never got up and interrupted your speeches. The Chair must respect me also. T respect you, but the Chair must respect the Members also. You must respect me as a Member, I respect you as Chirman, But you should respect me when 1 speak. I have not yet finished my speech.

I say, this House is not so helpless. I say, the Chair is not so helpless. I say, the Parliamentary Affairs Minister is not so helpless. We should take a decision on this vital matter. You should take the initiative, you should ask him to come and make a statement, you fix the time. If he doesn't come, we will decide; let the House decide. Why don't you take the initiative? That is my question. Do you want us to get charity?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI N. E BALARAM; Why? THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There are certain procedures.

SHRI N. E BALARAM: I can tell you... (Interruptions)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: There is no such procedure. Madam. I have gons and summoned before the House the Prime Minister of the country to demand an explanation...*(Interruptions)* ... I have gone and told the Prime Minister . . . *(Interruptions').*

SHRI N. E BALARAM; I saw him running. (Interruptions... At that time I was sitting by his side and this gentleman was running to fetch the Minister. This geniieman was running to fetch the Minister This happened in this House. You were there. You forget everything. Still you cannot forget conveniently many, many things. I am asking you.. .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What you are asking is beyond me.

SHRI N E BALARAM: Madam. you are strong enough to ask him to come. You are in the Chair. We are requesting you to do it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I heard you. Now listen to me.

In the first instance you said that you don't agree with my opinion. What was my opinion? I said, "Nobody is disagreeing with the demand that the Minister

should come here." Don't you agree with this?

SHRl N. E. BALARAM; I did not go into the disagreement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You said that. You made a blanket suggestion _

SHRl N. E. BALARAM: That is not my disagreement. My disagreement is on the basic question. You said, "Why don't you gio to the other items of the agenda?" That is the question you raised.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: My duty as the presiding officer is also to run this House.

SHRi N. E. BALARAM: I want to discuss the items on the agenda. 1 am with you. Bat let him come and give an explanation. Let him come and tell us about it. Then we can go straightway to it. We have no objection. That is ail.. . *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute, please, please, please.

Mr. Balaram, this is the way, whera I want to speak to you, the people inter, rupt. Thar is why you don't hear what I say.

Mr. Balaram, I want to put the record straight and let you hear that right from the beginning I have said, "Nobody is disputing the fact that you have a right to call the Minister to give, whatever you call it, an explanation. You can summon him or request him." I said it three times. You can see the record tomorrow morning when it comes to your House. The only thing is that I also told the minister to convey this message to the Minister concerned, Mr. Bhardwaj, about whom you are talking. While we are doing this, as a senior Member, don't you think that while the! Minister can go and find out if Mr. Bhardwaj is sitting, in the Central Hall or in the Lobby—I have no eyes over there, and I have to handle this House.. *(Interruptions)* Listen to me. Please listen to me. Please listen to me.

SHRl SURESH KALMADI (Maha, rashtra) Install a camera there, I would suggest for future.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute.

While we are awaiting an answer from Mr. Bhardwaj when he can come and speak to the House, we can continue with some business Do you object to that? Do you object to doing any busi_ ness? 1 will adjourn the House. I will adjourn the House with a note that you are not interested in doing anything.. . *(Interruptions).*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: We are interested in doing the business. We are interested in doing the business of democracy. We are interested in running democracy in thig country properly. •.. *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Order.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Madam, you give a direction to him to give the time.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How do! you know what I told him? I do not have to announce everything that I tell him.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: In certain cases, Madam, you have to tell us what you have told the Minister.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOW. DHURY; The whole House is upset. The sense of the Houke is not being taken into consideration.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I can only give directions if yod give me anything in writing... *(Interruptions)* On oral request I won't give any direction. *(Interruptions).*

"श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह: अगर आप इजाजत दें तो मैं कुछ कहना चाहता हूं। . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Are you asking! us to give it in writing, Madam?

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : आप बैठिये । ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: I was talking to the Chair before you started talking to the Chair.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: He should apologise to her.

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : आप भी बैठिये। यह क्या तरीका है। मैं कह रहा हूं कि पिछले आधे घंटे में उंगली इस तरह से उठाकर आपका ध्यान अपनी ओर आकर्षित करना चाह रहा हूं लेकिन आपका ध्यान कहीं और जा रहा है। क्या इस हाउस में यह हो गया है कि जो आपसे परमिशन मांगे उसको परमीशन नहीं मिलेगी और जो खुद ही उठ जाय वह उठ जाय।

उपसभापति : जैसे आप उठ गये।

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : इसलिये मैं आपसे कहना चाहता हूं कि जो आपसे परमीशन मांगे और जिसका नाम आप बोलें वह ही उठकर बोले। मैं इतनी देर से हाथ उठाये हुए हूं लेकिन आप मेरी ओर ध्यान ही नहीं दे रही हैं और जो लोग खुद उठकर बोल रहे हैं उनकी ओर आप देखती जा रही हैं। इसलिये मुझे अपनी बात कहने के लिये उठना पड़ा है।

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA (Gujarat): I support his allegation. *(Interruptions)*

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : मैं आपसे यह कहना चाहता हूं कि श्री भारद्वाज इस सदन के एक सम्माननीय सदस्य ही नहीं हैं बल्कि भारत सरकार के ला एंड जस्टिस मंत्री भी हैं। अगर आप ला एंड जस्टिस मंत्री के द्वारा कही गयी बात पर विश्वास नहीं करेंगे, सदन के किसी सदस्य की कही बात पर विश्वास नहीं करेंगे कल से हमारी साख कहां जाएगी? इसलिए मैं नियम 241 के तहत आपसे कहना चाहता हूं कि जितनी बातें उनके बारे में कही गई हैं एज ए मैम्बर आफ काउंसिल आफ मिनिस्टर्ज, आप उनको डायरेक्शन दें कि आज पांच बजे तक वे यहां आ कर के अपनी बात इस सदन में कहें। अगर उन्होंने कहा है तो उन मंत्रियों के नाम दें अगर नहीं कहा है तो और के ऊपर मानहानि का मुकदमा चलाएं। i his is, *toy* only suj>missjpa.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: For personal explanation जिस रूल की तरफ आपने मेरा ध्यान खींचा है, मैं बहुत देर से कह रही हूं। आप हाथ उठा रहे थे, मेरी बात नहीं सुन रहे थे। मैंने यह कहा कि मैं डायरेक्शन दूंगी जब आप मुझे कुछ लिख कर देंगे। मैं हवा में की हुई बातों पर डायरेक्शन नहीं दे सकती। आप लिख कर के भेज दीजिये। अगर आप यह समझते हैं तो लिख कर दे दीजिये। आपको लिख कर देने में क्या एतराज है? (व्यवधान)

श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा (बिहार) : मैडम, इस सदन में जितनी बातें उठाई जाती हैं (व्यवधान)

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: There is a whole country outside which is watching this shameful performacn* today.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I agree with you. They are watching the shemeful ful performance.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Yes. I am glad that you agree som«-where. *{Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Whwi you don't sit down, that also the peopl* are watching,

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Yes, that also. It is shameless. The Chair is trying to correct it. *(Interruptions),*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. IS Members arc not iu a mood really to perform the business, which is listed, I have no objection in adjourning the House. 1 am adjourning the House for lunch till 2.30 p.m.

The House then adjourned for lunch at twelve minutes past ont ef the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch *m* thirty-three minutes Past tow of the clock, The Vice-Chairman (Shri Shankar Dayal Singh) in the Chair.

RE: DEMAND TO SUMMON SHRl H. R. BHARDWAJ, MINISTER OF STATE TN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS, FOR CLARIFYING HIS POSITION REGARDING HIS T.V. INTERVIEW— *Contd.*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA; Whers is Mr. Bhardwaj?

.. . (Interruptions)...

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL *alius* MEEM AFZAL: Where is Bhardwaj?

भारद्वाज साहब को बुलाइये. . . (व्यवधान) यह हाउस इसलिए एडजर्न हुआ था कि ला मिनिस्टर को ढूंढकर यहां पेश किया जाए. . . (व्यवधान) एडजर्न कर दीजिए हाउस. . (व्यवधान)

SHRI S JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, you are fully aware of the fact that the House adjourned t facilitate the return of the Law Minister to the House.. *.(Interruptions)*.. . The Parliamentary Affairs Minister told us... *(Interruptions)...* about youth ruling.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह): पहली बात यह है. . . (व्यवधान) मैं आपसे निवेदन. . . (व्यवधान)

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : पहले आप सबकी सुन लीजिए।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : ऐसा है कि मैं आपकी बात सुनने के लिए तैयार हूं बट बन वाई बन। ऐसे नहीं होगा।

SHRl GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, since morning we have been agirated in a most unprecedented way by the most unprecedented uucment by a member of the Council of Ministers, which hs is reported to have made to a media person. We had witnessed a number of scandals.

SHRl V. NARAYANASAMY. Mc. Vice-Chairman.. I am on a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRl SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): I will give. you the time. Please take your seat first . . *(Interruptions)*.. .

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I have got the right to raise a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Mr. Gupta, please take your seat. Let me hear his point of order.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Under what rule?

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: Under what rule?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): I am not P-uting this question to Mr. Narayanasamy because he is also one of the Vice-Chairmen in the panel.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, the issue that is being raised by Shri Gurudas Das Gupta now was raised this morning by him and also by Shri Jaipal Reddyji and other hon. Members on the other side. When a poift of order was raised by Members on this side, the Chair gave a ruling. It is on record. The Chair observed that if they wanted to raise that issue, it should be raised in the proper form giving notice. Now, Sir, ignoring that observation made by the Chair, the ruling given by the Chair, hon. Members. ,. *(Interruptions)*,.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: No.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: No ruling was given,

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: It was not a ruling.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Let me complete.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Please finish it.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I am going to finish.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: He is making a full-fledged speech.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRl SHANKAR DAYAL, SINGH): Kindly tell *us.. .(Interruptions).* KimKy tell me what your point of orcbr is. *(Interrup tions).*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: In 1989, you met the same fate. The observa'ion by the Chair in the morning was on the same question which was raised by hon. Members from the other side.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): What is your point of order?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: My point of ordsr is that once a ruling is given by the Chair on a point raised by hon. Members from the other side, they cannot again be permitted to raise the same issue. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: No ruling was given.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: They should not be allowed to speak again on that.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I am afraid the hon. Member.. . *(Interrup tions).*

5

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, I need your ruling on that. *(Interrup tion).*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: There is no point of order. That is the ruling. THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): All of you, pleas; taks your sea s. First, I want to hear all. Then I wil! give my ruling.

SHRl V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, he *li* not raising a point of order. *(Interruptions).* The hon. Member is not raising a point of order. I have raised a point of ord *r.* Sir, 1 seek your indulgence. I nee J your ruling on my point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Plase sit down. It is the discretion of the Chair. I am ready to give my ruling. But, first, I will also hear Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, Mr. Jaipal Reddy, Mr. Mathur and others. Then I will give my ruling. Please do not press me. It is my own discretion. *(Interruption).* No. No. I am not going to give tay ruling now.

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल : सर, मेरी शिकायत है---जो सुबह आपकी शिकायत थी, वही शिकायत मेरी अब है।

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل : سر، میری شکایت ہے۔ جو آپکی شکایت تھی وہی شکایت میری اب ہے۔

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Sir, the hon. Member has made a point of order. Let other Members also speak on whether that point of order is valid under the rules or not. Then only you can give your ruling. *(Interruption).*

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल : जो सुबह आपकी शिकायत थी, वही शिकायत मेरी भी है कि जो लोग हाथ उठाते रहते हैं, उनको... (व्यवधान)

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل : جو صبح آپکی شکایت تھی وہی شکایت میری بھی ہے کہ جو لوگ ہاتھ اٹھاتے رہتے ہیں ان کو ... مداخلت ...

† [ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script,

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : आप मेरी बात सुन लीजिए । . . . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल : मैं समझता हूं कि आपके चेयर पे रहते हुए नाइन्साफी नहीं होगी ।

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل : میں سمجھتا ہوں کہ آپ کے چیئرمین رہتے ہوئے یہ ناانصافی نہیں ہوگی ۔

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : अफजल साहब ऐसा है कि मेरी शिकायत और आपकी शिकायत का फर्क है कि जब कोई सदस्य वहां बैठा रहता है तो उसकी शिकायत कुछ और होती है और जब इस कुर्सी पर रहता है, तो उसकी मर्माहत कुछ और होती है ।

इसलिए इस तकलीफ की समझते हुए आप और सब चेयर से कोआपरेट कीजिए, जिससे कि सदन की मर्यादा भी बने और काम भग हो और किसी तरह की बात भी नहीं हो ।

बोलिए, गुरुदास दास गुप्त जी ।

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, my point is this. If you Billow them without giving a ruling on the point of order raised by me, my point of order will become frustrated and it will serve no purpose laser. Therefore, kindly give a ruling on that.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): My ruling is reserved. Please take your seat. First, I will hear him and othere also. Then I will give my ruling.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, the hon. Member has been misinformed or he he misunderstood in the morning), there was no ruling whatsoever from the Chair.

† [ ] Transliteration in Arabic Srript.

SHRJ V. NARAYANASAMY:"" Kindly go through the proceedings of the House. There is a ruling given by the Chair.

SHRl GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: 1 am only referring to the morning proceedings. What I am saying is that* maybe, the entire House was unanimous on the point point that we stand totally dishonoured by the seatments supposed to have been made by a member of the Council ot Ministers. Parliament cannot work, in a situation of dishonour when indignity has been hurled on us. Therefore, Sir, in orde. U: get the situation cleared, we wanted the Minister concerned to be kind enough TO present himself before the House and share the information that he is having. He has not done it. I only wish the Chair to direct the Government to kindly ensure that the Minister of State for Law no longer commits any irregularity by keeping himself absent from the House while he is loitering within the premises of the building.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Sir, you will kindly recollect that in the forenoon session or in the pre-llunch session, the House that he would convev the feelings of Members of the House to the Law Minister. In fact, the House was adjourned, in a way, for the purpose. When the House met in the afternoon, one expected the Parliamentary Affairs Minister to rise in his seat and make a statement on the discussion but he has not so far made any statement. Our authentic information is, the Law Minister is not at large. He is very much available within the Parliament premises. It couldn't have been physically or otherwise impossible! for the Parliamentary Affairs Minister to establish contact with him and he should be able to say something and this matter is of supreme public importance because he is a Minister; and what he says, applies four square to the entire Cabinet. We would like to know whether this Government is governed by the principle of collective responsibility or not.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : श्रीमान, मेरे दल ने प्रातःकाल वाक आउट किया

का इसलिए कि सरकार की तरफ से कोई जवाब नहीं दिया गया, आश्वासन नहीं दिया गया। मैं और मेरा दल समझता था कि शायद हमारे वाक आउट करने के बाद और इन सहयोगियों के दबाव के बाद सरकार कुछ कहेगी, जवाब देगी। लेकिन मैं सदन में आया हूं तो मैंने देखा कि सरकार उसी प्रकार से सुस्त और जवाब न देने के मूड में है। इस कारण से मैं सरकार के रवैये की भरपूर भर्त्सना करता हूं और आपसे अपेक्षा करता हूं कि आप सरकार को निर्देश देंगे अथवा चेयरमैन से दिलवायेंगे। लेकिन जब सुबह मैंने बात कही थी और मेरे मित्रों ने बातें कही हैं, उससे कुछ बातें और जोड़ना चाहता हूं। जहां तक श्री भारद्वाज जी के स्वयं का सवाल है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : ऐसा है माथुर साहब...

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : दो मिनट में कह रहा हूं।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : नहीं भाषण के लिए नहीं।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : भाषण नहीं दे रहा हूं।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह) : हमने आपको जो प्वाइंट यहां लोगों ने रेज किया है.... (व्यवधान)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : इसी के अलावा कह रहा हूं।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह): नहीं तो आप लंबी तकरीर... (व्यवधान)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: नहीं। लंबी तकरीर नहीं कर रहा हूं मैं तो क्योंकि सदन में डिस्टर्बेन्स के बाद आया हूं, इसलिए मुझे अपनी बात पर कहने में क्यों आ गया, कैसे आ गया। मेरा ...(व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीशंकर दयाल सिंह) : आप सक्षम हैं दो लाइन में भी अपनी बात कहने के लिए।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मैं दूसरी बात अलग कह रहा हूं। प्रातःकाल हम लोगों ने यह कहा था कि उन्होंने पैसे की बात कही है। उसके अलावा मेरे ध्यान में आया है पैसे की बात नहीं कही, उन्होंने दूसरे कैबिनेट में जब पहले थे बूटा सिंह को अकाली भी कहा है। इतना ही नहीं, इसके साथ उन्होंने स्व० राजीव गांधी का उल्लेख करते भी दस बातें कही हैं। इसलिए यह जुर्म दुगुना, तिगुना, चौगुना, छः गुना होता जा रहा है। समस्या और गहरी होती जा रही है सरकार के मुंह पर कालिख बढ़ती रही है। इसलिए अत्यन्त आवश्यक है कि जहां पैसे का घपला है वहां पर बूटा सिंह जी को अकाली बता कर एक प्रकार से करना श्री राजीव गांधी के विषय में उल्लेख करना, यह जुर्म को और बढ़ा रहा है। इसलिए श्रीमन्, मेरा निवेदन आपसे यह है कि सरकार बयान, आपकी तरफ से या सरकार की तरफ से अनुमति दी जाए किसी को कि वह सदन के पटल पर रख दे। यदि नहीं रखा जाता तो हम चाहेंगे कि आप और चेयरमैन महोदय स्वयं इसका अवलोकन करें और अवलोकन करने के पश्चात् सरकार को निदेश दे और अगर निर्देश देने की स्थिति में नहीं हैं तो मेरा अनुरोध यह होगा कि जब तक यह मामला सुलझता नहीं, या तो हम लोग ऐसे ही शोर मचाते रहेंगे नहीं तो आप इस मामले पर सुबह चेयरमैन साहब से सलाह होने तक सदन को एडजॉर्न कर दीजिए।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH) Mr. Mentay Padmanabham.. .(Interruptions)..

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: A blackmail threat has been issued to the Chair. ...(Intenuptions).. .He has said categorically, "We will not allow you to run th* House. Either you adjourn the House or go and take advice from the Deputy Chairman." This is what he said.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मेरी सलाह है कि . . . (व्यवधान) . . . यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है और इस मामले को सुलझाने तक . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

SHRl V, NARAYANASAMY: He is trying to blackmail the Chair.

THE- VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Kindly tell your points, Mr. Padmanabham.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Sir, I don't want to go into what happened this morning. This is already clear. Everybody who is present here knows what happened this morning. Sir. the real issue is that Mr. Bhardwaj, Law Minister, should be invited to this House or called to this House or summoned to this House, whatever word you use; he should coma and share his views with the House. This is the *crux* of the problem. I do not know why the Government is hesitating to call him or ask him to make a statement or appear before this House to make a statement. If there are weighty reasons on the Government side, let them come out openly. The Parliamentary Affairs Minister is here. As Mr. Jaipal Reddy pointed out, this morning we all requested this House to ask the Parliamentary Affairs Minister to convey this and also convey whatever is said by the hon. Minister to this House. This has not happened. What is really the problem with the Government? Even now it is not late. Let the Government come out with some statement or the other, whether they are calling their own Minister before this House or whether the Minister is prepared to give a statement or not. Otherwise, we have taken a decision; we have come to a point from where we cannot go back; unless the Government says something, we cannot. The entire House has come to a conclusion that unless some resiponse comes *from* the Govemment, the stalemate wiil continue whether Mr. Vishvjit Singh ot any one else has taken it as a threat or a blackmail, whatever it is, this is the view of the majority of the Members of the House. Therefore, even now I request the Parliamentary Affairs Minister to say something on this matter.

SHRl MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu)-. Mr. Vice-Chairman, this is a qiw-i-tion of the honour of the House and of the power of the Chair. When we dispersed in 'he forenoon, we all thought Madam was going that so that she might invits Mr. Bhardwaj to the House. But this is not happening. Parliamentary Affairs Minister is sitting here, simply smiling at us. Sir, Mr. Bhardwaj has done somethng unprecedented. . .(Interruption). . .Mr. Bhardwaj has done something unprecendented in parliamentary history. Never before has such a thing been done, because he has cast aspersions on his own Government, on the other members *ot* the Council of Ministers and on the other Members of the Rajya Sabha. For example, he has cost aspersions on Mr. Buta Singh who is a Member of Lok Sabha, he has oast aspersions on Mr. Shiv Shanker who is a Member of Rajya Sabha. And the worst part of it is that no Government *can* tolerate such a Minister if he has spoken like that. Therefore, two things are clear. This is not a print media report. It is a video recording. Video recording was sent to the Censor Office and the Censor Office censored certain portions and those portions contained almost the same thing. Thanks to Mr. Jethmalani, we have got the censored portions. We have seen the censored portions If what Mr. Bhardwaj says is true, then I say the entire Government should go otherwise Mr. Bhardwaj should be asked to resign; To decide this he should be summoned here before it is too late.

SHRI D1NESHBHAT TRIVEDI (Gujarat) : Sir, I have *to* ask a simple question. Has the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs been able to get in touch with Mr. Bhardwaj? He has promised... *(Interrup' tion).* . . Has he been able to do that or not ?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRl KANKAR DAYAL SINGH):

ठीक है, त्रिवेदी जी बैठिए। मैं लोगों की बात सुनलूं तब इधर मुखातिब होता हूं।

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, what happened to my point of order?

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Sir, we have already discussed this point of order. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): I will give my ruling after hearing the Members, i*Interruptions)*....

SHRl YASHWANT SINHA: Mr. Vice. Chairman, Sir, the hon. Deputy Chairman was wind enough fo observe in the morning that ail these involved a new stage of time and a lot of waste of public expenditure. I hold the Government entirely responsible for every minute that this House is losing because the simplest thing which we expected from the Government was that at 2.30 p.m. when we reassembled the hon. Minister of State for Parliamentary Affairs could have got up and told us, "This is what I have done." There was some private understanding between him and the Deputy Chairperson to which we are not privy. But we were told in very clear terms that an understanding had been reached and the House would be taken into confidence and we expected, in all fairnes, that at 2.30 P.M. the Minister of State for Parliamentary Affairs would tell us when exactly Mr. Bhardwaj is going to make a statement. Now my point is very simple. This is not a blackmail. This is not a threat. This is an assertion of our right. There cannot be any transaction of any business in this House as long as there are these serious allegations standing in the name of a Member of this House, who also happens to be a member of the Council of Ministers, against other fellow hon. Members Of this House. This is the situation.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Don't try to hijack the proceedings of the House.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It s not a question of hijacking the proceedings. *(Interruptions)* .. Mir. Narayanasamy, don't try to provoke me. *(Interruptions)* ... Don't try to provoke me. *(.Interruptions)* ...

SHRl V. NARAYANASAMY: When you were the Minister how many times *{Iniem&i&n?)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: We know how you have hijacked the proceedings of the House. So, don't tell me. *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Mr. Nacisions)... *(Intenuptions)*.. .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Don't tell us what you have done. *(Interruptions)* .. .When you were sitting on this side, what was your behaviour? The history of the country is witness to that. The history of the country shows the way you behaved. *(Interruptions)*... So, don't tell us how we should be*have. (Interruptions)* ....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH3: Mr. Narayanasamy, please hear him.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Mr| Vice-Chairmam, fo, it is very simple. Our demand is extremely reasonable. There cannot be a more reasonable demand. We expected the Minister of State for Parliamentary Affairs to get up and tell us what the exchange is which has taken place between him and Mir. Bhardwaj and when Mr. Bhardwaj is going to make a statement in this House. This is the position in a nutshell. If he does not, then. Sir, they w;ll be responsible for all that happens in the House.

SHRI *M. A.* BABY: Sir, a correct decssions ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, you have not given a ruling on my point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): After hearing I will give. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Then, what is the purpose of giving a ruling on my point of order? *(Interrdptions).*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH); Mr. Narayanasamy, please... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: You have been threatening the Chair. *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Mr. Narayanasamy, please. *(Interruptions)...*

Mr. Narayanasamy, please.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: The Chair has to give a ruling on my point of order. *(Interruption!!)*.. .

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Mr. Narayanasamy, please take your seat. *(Interruptions)*.. .

SHRl V. NARAYANASAMY: On my point of order a ruling has to be given by the Chair. *(Interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Mr. Narayanasamy, please. *(Interruptions)...* Mr. Narayanasamy, you are right. *(Interruptions)*.. . No, I think that you are.. . *(Interruptions)*.. .

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Raising a point of order is my right.. *(Interruptions),*. .

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Please hear me first. Why don't you hear me first? *(Interruptions)...* You please take your seat. Please hear me. (*Interruptions)* .. .

SHRl V. NARAYANASAMY; When are you giving your ruling? May I know when you are going to give the ruling on the point of order I raised? *(interruptions)* . ..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAY AL SINGH): You please take your seal. *(Interruptions)...* You please take your seat *(Interrup' lions)*.. .

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I have a right to know this. *(Interruptions)*.. .

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): I am telling you now. You first take your seat. Please hear me. *(Interruptions)...* Please hear me One minute. I am not going to oblige you just now by giving my ruling. *(Interruptions)*.. .

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I nave right, as a Member to raise a point of Order,.. *(Interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Why don't you think about tie right of the Chair? *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY;...and I have got a right to know what ruling you are giving... *(Interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): May I know from you the right of the Cnair? *(Interruptions),*. .

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: You people have threatened the Chair and the Chair... *(Interruptions)...* You are saying that I am threatening the Chair. What kind of House are you running? *(Interruptions)*.. .

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Mr. Narayanasamy, you are very right. You have got the right. But the Chair has also got a right. I can keep my ruling .. .*{Interruptions)*.. . Please hear me. *(Interruptions)*.. .

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY. *On* a point of order the Chairman or the Presiding Officer can reserve the ruling. You have raised a point of order.. . *(In-IfrruPtions)*.. .

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH.: Mr. Jaipal Reddy.. . *(Interruptions)*.. .

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I have a right to know *the* ruling on the point of order. *(Interruptions)*.. .

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: The Chairman has already stated that he would give the filling after hearing the members.

SHRI M. A. BABY; Sir. a correct decision and veiling on this particular

controversy is very important because the dignity of this House is largely dependent, I think, on how we are going to conduct, how we are going to resolve this controversy today. It is well known that this is an unprecedented situation. Never before, as has been mentioned here, in the history of Parliament has a member of the Council of Ministers come out with such devasting relevations. Sir, if it is true and if the Council of Ministers still stand by his statement, I should appreciate his rare and daring forthrightness, daring display of his curate to more out with these revelations. But that has yet to be ortaMr'sfied. *The only thing I would* like to mention is, in the recent past we have been witnessing the spectacle of different institutions being devalued in our country. It is one thing. On the basis of pressure from somebody or some powers the rupee is being devalued. Sir, today the highest office, the office •of the chief executive of our country, is also being devalued. Now what is being questioned is, wnether we would allow this august Hhouse to be devalued or not. (Interruptions).

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, what is the subject in question? If he goes on accusing the Government or accusing somebody else, how can we... *(Interruptions).* What is the subject in question? Is it a debate on the Government or performance of the Government? *(interruption.s)* .

SHRI M. A. BABY: Therefore, as an august body, it is not only the responsiblity of those who are sitting this side of the House but also of those who are sitting on the other side of the House. I appeal to all that the dignity of the House is at stake, the dignity of the parliamentary institutions is at stake. if we allow the dignity of the parliamentary institution to be lowered, then nothing else will remain in our country. Therefore, we expect the Parliamentary Affairs Minister to state whether he has succeeded in conveying the sense of the House. Fortunately, the Leader of the House and the Home Minister is also present here. He should know what is happening in bis home. There fore, I hope that without any delay the Minister, who is expected to be still the Minister for Law and Justice, should be requested to come to the House and clear the doubt whether he still stands by the accusations or not. If he still stands by the accusations, when the Minister of Law and Justice himself makes such accusations, I don't find any reason for such a Government to conti nue. Therefore, without resolving this issue, we cannot cooperate with any Offer *business of the House. Without* resolving this issue, we cannot coope rate with any other business of the House because at stake is the dignityof the House.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Now. Mr. S. B. Chavan.

SHRl P. UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, allow me to speak. *(Interruptions).*

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह): आप ऐसा करें कि एक-दो मिनट और सुन लीजिए।

सभा के नेता (श्री एस० बी० चव्हाण): यह कोई डिबेट तो है नहीं। (व्यवधान) यह कोई डिबेट चल रही है ?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Mr. s. B. Chavan is here. He wants to way something. I feel that he has already realised the mood of the House. If he warns to say something, let him say.

SHRl P. UPENDRA: Sir, T also want to say something.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Let us hear Mr. Chavan first.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN; I have con-, voyed the feelings of the House to my colleague, Mr. H. R. Bhardwaj. He is expected any moment. He will come here and clarify the position.

THE, VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SH-ANKAR DAYAL SINGH): That is good.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: He should issue a suo motu statement.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: In all fairness, kindly adjourn the House. *(Intenuptions).*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): After the statement made by the Leader of the House. T think, there is no scope left. 3.00 P.M.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: No, Sir. We had been raising this matter since 12 today and we expect the Government to tell us when Mr. Bhardway will come. Any moment" can extend up to late evening "Any moment" can go on till tomorrow. We expect the Government *to* tell us whether he is coming in 10 minutes or 5 minutes. We had clearly said that we would not thansact any business until Mr. Bhardwaj made a statement.

SHRI S B. CHAVAN: 1 have asked him to come immediately and clarify the position.

VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): I am taking up the special mentions... (Interruptions). . .

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Sir, I had given a Zero Hour submission and my name was the first. The Chairman had given me permission and you are going agaist it ... (interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): I have no information.. . *(Interruptions).. .*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : I am very sorry. The Chairman told me. The Secret-aty General was also there.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH) : I have called him now. After he finishes you can speak.. . *(Interruptions)*

SPECIAL MENTIONS

Konkan Railway *Project*

SHRI O. RAJAGOPAL (Madhya Pradesh): The Konkan Railway project is a 750 kilometres long railway line. It is a unique railway line which will facilitate easy travel from North to Souh and from South to North. It covers three Sta tes: Maharashtra, Goa and Karnataka. This is a line in which Kerala is equally interested because the biggest beneficiaries of this railway line are the people from Kerala. Now. after a lot of waiting per mission has been given to continue with the Konkan Railway project. I understand a 68-kilometre line in the Mangalore-Udipi section has been completed. Soalso 46-kilometre line in the Rona—Dagon section has been completed. 205 kilomet res of this line runs through Goa. In the case of 54 kilometres there is a dispute! regarding alignment of Konkan Railway between Mayam and Bali. This is the shortest route and it was decided by the Railway Board after proper scrutiny and investigation. This is a rtute which through the coastal area and it was approved by the Chief Ministers of Maharashtra, Goa. Karnataka and Kerala. Now. people have raised objection saying that it is not proper to have a railway line through the coastal areas and they say that it must run through interior areas. The Railway Board appointed an expert committee under the leadership of an engineer. Mr. Menezes. He is a noted engineer and hails from Goa. He looked into th; matter and came to the conclusion that alignment by the coastl route which was previously approved by the Railway Board is the right alignment. He suggested some minor modifications. The Railway Board had accepted those modifications and the work commenced. Now, about Rs. 115 crores have been set apart for cous-action of the railway line passing through Goa out of which Rs. 47 crore*' have already been expended. And the Government has committed around Rs. 45 crores to various contractors and other people. Land has also been acquired and those people who were to be evicted have also been evicted. After doing all these things, a very powerful lobby of smugglers, who operate in the name of religion, has come forward to exert pressure on the Govemment to abandon the work on this route and instead to have the entire railway line through the interior road. New. this lobby is so powerful, it appears, lat it has influenced the Prime Minister iiim-sclf and, as per reports, at the intervention